

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
February 28, 2005**

Pursuant to due call and notice the Civil Service Commission of the City of Dickinson met at City Hall, Monday, February 28, 2005 at 8:30 AM.

**ROLL CALL:**

Members present were: Todd Tavis, Cal Kolling, Ray Ann Kilen and Bob Jenkins  
Absent was: Bryan Personne

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

Greg Sund stated the minutes should read Fox Lawson and Associates or Fox Lawson not Fox and Lawson.

MOTION BY: Cal Kolling                      SECONDED BY: Bob Jenkins

To approve the minutes of January 7, January 19 and January 24, 2005 with the change of to Fox and Lawson to Fox Lawson and Associates or Fox Lawson.

DISPOSITION: Motion declared duly passed.

**REVIEW INTERNAL POLICE CHIEF APPLICATIONS:**

Todd Tavis started discussion stating it was approved amend the job description and to advertise internally via an electronic meeting. Tavis questioned if Civil Service is limiting themselves by keeping the hiring as an internal one. Greg Sund stated he doesn't believe so as he thinks the City currently has highly qualified individuals for the position within the department. Sund stated he is surprised only three individuals applied. Ray Ann Kilen commented having only three candidates for a position of this level is weak and wished there were more. Kilen stated she liked the idea of the electronic meeting.

Bob Jenkins questioned with the change in the job description, how many individuals were disqualified. Sund stated he didn't believe anyone was disqualified and possibly only one other individual could have applied and chose not to. Tim Kessel stated he feels the City has received good candidates, but after interviews, if the interview panel doesn't feel comfortable the position could still be opened externally. Tavis questioned the message it sends to the current applicants if we started with an internal hire and decide go external as well. Sund stated the City promotes the internal hiring process, and questioned if is just talk.

Kilen stated once again, she is concerned with having only two or three candidates. Jenkins stated this is an executive level position which is different than having only a couple applicants for a lower level position. Kilen stated this position can create a huge impact and the best person for the City is needed. Kessel referred to the Human Resource policy regarding internal hires and what the options were for Civil Service. Sund stated reasons to go outside of the department would be because of the age of the department, if the City were to have very young department this may be appropriate. Another reason would be if there are problems within the department.

Jenkins stated he would be more confident with five or more applicants. Kilen asked who would be doing the interviews and making the decision regarding the hiring of the Police Chief. Sund stated Commissioner Steiner and Reitmeier would be assisting him with the interviews and hiring. Kolling asked how the hiring has been done in the past. Sund stated Gary Banyai was selected by an assessment center, which Sund feels is subjective. Kilen stated a Civil Service member was on each of the committees for the last two department head hired, and questioned if there should be one for the Police Chief hiring. Sund stated it wasn't necessary.

Kilen said the problem with the electronic meeting is it removes the chance for discussion. Kilen also stated she's just not sure what to do. Cal Kolling stated with most of the other department head position the City looks externally and feels that a combination of internal/external posting should probably have been done in this case. Kessel stated the reason for the electronic meeting was due to quorum issues.

Kolling questioned if the City would look statewide if the position is opened externally. Kilen questioned the harm in opening the position externally. Kessel asked the Commission how they think the candidates would feel if the rules are changed halfway through the process.

MOTION BY:            Bob Jenkins                    SECONDED BY:        Ray Ann Kilen  
To open the police chief position externally.

DISCUSSION: Kilen stated the Civil Service Commission has nothing against the candidates that applied, but with a position of this level we feel it's best to expand the pool of candidates to confirm the City already has the best candidate. Kolling believes the Commission should have gone outside from the beginning. Kilen reiterated she feels we have good applicants, but feels three is not enough.

Stewart Stenberg spoke of the preparation of the personnel from the police department. Stenberg told the Commission the candidates have been to very good schools and feels the candidates are qualified and it would be an injustice to the department if the staff wasn't properly trained. Jenkins stated very few sworn officers attend the Civil Service Meetings.

Kilen questioned the process stating if there had been an actual meeting, instead of the electronic correspondence, the City may have been directed through discussion that if fewer than five applications were received the position should have been opened automatically to external candidates. Jenkins stated he would not have an issue if five or six applications had been received. Kessel commented the quantity is somewhat immaterial as long as the quality of the candidates is good.

DISPOSITION:        Motion declared duly passed.

**POLICE DEPARTMENT RECLASSIFICATION REQUESTS:**

Todd Tavis stated at the last meeting the Commission approved sending the Communication Specialist position to Fox Lawson and Associates for a possible

reclassification. Fox Lawson and Associates have responded to the request. Tavis stated the response indicated the Communication Specialist should be classified at A13, which is what the current classification is now. Dana Becker questioned why the classification could be different for different municipalities. Becker stated Bismarck, who uses the Fox Lawson system, has their Communication Specialists classified as a B21 which means they are paid better. Becker stated Dickinson used to be the 3<sup>rd</sup> best paid communications center, but is currently closer to the bottom for pay. The Commission discussed the Fox Lawson system as to how it was set up and is being administered.

Bob Jenkins stated Civil Service has accepted what Fox Lawson and Associates have recommended in the past. Kessel stated this more of a pay issue than anything. Becker questioned the Commission if they feel a Communication Specialist should be an A13. Tavis stated like-positions were sent along with the Communication Specialist position and that Civil Service usually doesn't go against the recommendation of Fox Lawson and Associates. Kilen stated the Communication Specialist position isn't the only position that has changed and we might not like the response from Fox Lawson, but we have to accept what they recommended.

Tavis stated the Commission has several options, one accept the recommendation presented from Fox Lawson and Associates, two make a recommendation to the City Commission as this is a market issue or three reclassify the position. Jenkins told Becker and the Communication Specialist present the Commission is not blindly accepting what Fox Lawson recommended. Jenkins state a decision was made a while back by the Commission to accept the recommendations provided by Fox Lawson and Associates.

MOTION BY: Bob Jenkins                      SECONDED BY: Cal Kolling  
To accept the recommendation from Fox Lawson and Associates to keep the  
Communication Specialist position at an A13.

DISCUSSION: Phyllis Duda-Parsons stated comparing an A13 position of Communication Specialist to an A13 Administrative assistant is like comparing apples and oranges and she just doesn't understand the system. Todd Tavis stated City staff is currently making arrangements to have Bruce Lawson here to explain the system and how to properly administer the system. Cal Kolling said there is a need to know why its one classification here and a different one in Bismarck. Joan Koenig asked why all A13 positions are all paid the same when the Communication Specialist works nights, weekends and holidays. Koenig stated they should get more for working such shifts. It was stated the Meet and Confer Committee is currently working on the pay differential issue. Tim Kessel told Civil Service he had distributed a survey to employees to regarding the Fox Lawson system. Kessel reported he received only a small number of surveys back from employees. Kessel stated he was told employees may not have returned the surveys because he asked for the employee's names and they may feel intimidated.

DISPOSITION: Motion declared duly passed.

MOTION BY: Bob Jenkins



**OTHER:**

Todd Tavis reminded the Commission of the Job Fair to be held on March 9<sup>th</sup> at Dickinson State University.

Tim Kessel reported there will be two new position descriptions placed on a future agenda for Civil Service to classify the positions and also to authorize advertise and fill the positions.

It was recommended a specific structure be set for the meeting(s) with Fox Lawson and Associates.

MOTION BY:           Ray Ann Kilen           SECONDED BY:    Cal Kolling  
To adjourn the meeting at 10:07 am.

OFFICAL MINUTES PREPARED BY:

---

Kristi Broer, Administrative Assistant

Approved: April 15, 2005