

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
March 4, 2005**

Pursuant to due call and notice the Civil Service Commission of the City of Dickinson met at City Hall, Friday, March 4, 2005 at 8:30 AM.

**ROLL CALL:**

Present were: Todd Tavis, Ray Ann Kilen, Bob Jenkins and Bryan Personne

Absent was: Cal Kolling

**INTERNAL HIRE FOR POLICE CHIEF:**

Todd Tavis opened the discussion stating with the decision to open the Police Chief externally at the meeting on Monday, February 28, 2005 does not follow the City code. Tavis gave options of what could be done as written by City code. They are as follows:

1. Let stand our original decision and the internal applicants are rejected and we advertise externally.
2. Reverse our decision, review the internal applicants to determine if we have qualified applicants internally and then make a decision whether we forward the short list on or determine that there are no qualified internal candidates and advertise externally.
3. Review internal applicants and forward the qualified ones as the short list to be interviewed.

Ray Ann Kilen stated Civil Service has nothing against the three candidates that applied. Kilen reiterated the candidates are good ones, but that Civil Service would have like to have had five or more candidates and agreed to the internal hire if there were enough candidates. Bryan Personne stated the hang up could potentially be the public's perception the Commission didn't do the right thing by not going outside.

Kilen said we tried the electronic meeting, it didn't work. Kilen stated she would not agree to an electronic meeting in the future as it removes the discussion factor. Kilen stated it feels as if Civil Service is being backed into a corner because of a perceived poor decision. Kilen commented on rumors she has heard saying it was opened external to confirm we already had the best candidate in house. Kilen stated there needed to be discussion.

Tavis compared the current situation to the recent internal hire of the Senior Firefighter position. Following this discussion Tavis reviewed again what he felt the options were for Civil Service regarding the Police Chief position. With that it was pointed out the applications had not been reviewed and all of the discussion was about a potential roster.

Personne questioned the process to be followed if the applicants are approved as qualified and who would be on the interview committee. Personne also questioned if the interview committee could reject the list of candidates if they didn't feel comfortable with the

candidates following interviews. Sund reviewed the process and stated Carson Steiner, Bill Reitmeier and himself would be on the interview committee and yes the candidates could be rejected if after interviews the committee was not comfortable with the internal candidates. Personne commented he would not support an internal hire for any position in the future.

It was stated in the future management position will not be posted internally, which will normally confirm the best candidate is already employed by the City.

Tim Kessel asked the Commission to think about the message being sent to the employees with going external for potential promotional positions. Kessel briefly went through the code pointing out his issues with the way it's written.

MOTION BY: Bob Jenkins                      SECONDED BY: Ray Ann Kilen  
To rescind the decision made on Monday, February 28, 2005 to open the Police Chief position to external candidates and to accept and review the applications submitted.

DISCUSSION: Stewart Stenberg told Civil Service he does not feel the applicants felt rejected by Civil Service. Stenberg stated following the meeting on Monday a memo was placed in the roll call book notifying everyone the position was to be opened externally and the reasons for the decision. Stenberg stated if anything the candidates may have questioned their qualifications.

Stenberg went on to explain why the pool of candidates was not larger. Stenberg stated he didn't apply as he didn't feel it was fair to the Police Department or his family as he is considering retirement in the near future. Stenberg also gave an explanation of why there may have only been three candidates, stating experience and training were factors. Stenberg stated he feels all three of the candidates are qualified and would outshine any external candidates.

DISPOSITION: Motion carried unanimously.

Applications were reviewed by the Commission. The Commission asked it be noted for future internal applicants to fill in the boxes and not put see resume.

MOTION BY: Bob Jenkins                      SECONDED BY: Bryan Personne  
To approve the candidates (Rodney Banyai, William Leach and Charles Rummel) as qualified and forward them to City Administrator Sund for interviews.

DISPOSITION: Motion carried unanimously.

#### **PUBLIC WORKS TECHNICIAN – ENGINEERING:**

Tim Kessel presented several handouts to Civil Service regarding the current hiring process and the length of time it takes to hire an employee for the position. Kessel stated a Public Works Technician position for the Engineering Dept. was approved in the 2005 budget and that the City is ready to hire for the position. Also distributed was a possible 17 point system to be used by City staff to eliminate the initial review of the applicants

by Civil Service. Ray Ann Kilen stated she's not comfortable with having so few points, but stated she liked the break out of the points. The concern was having a large number of applicants with the same score. Bryan Personne stated he doesn't mind the point system presented, but suggested using a percentage for the Veteran's Preference points rather than the five or ten.

Kilen stated she's not ready to make any quick decisions and would prefer the current method for hiring. Todd Tavis stated with the way City code is written, Civil Service must continue to review applicants and then interview as stated. Kessel commented the current process is inefficient and the Engineering department needs someone hired as soon as possible. It was suggested hiring a temporary employee to fill the position until a permanent full time employee is hired. Potential dates for review of applicants and interviews and a possible hire date were discussed.

MOTION BY:            Bob Jenkins                      SECONDED BY:       Ray Ann Kilen  
To authorize advertisement for the Public Works Technician position in the Engineering Department.

DISPOSITION:        Motion carried unanimously.

MOTION BY:            Bob Jenkins                      SECONDED BY:       Ray Ann Kilen  
To adjourn the meeting at 9:47 AM.

OFFICIAL MINUTES PREPARED BY:

---

Kristi Broer, Administrative Assistant

Approved: April 15, 2005