

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

Friday, September 17, 2010

1. Pursuant to due call and notice the Civil Service Commission of the City of Dickinson met at City Hall, Friday, September 17, 2010 at 9:00 AM.
2. ROLL CALL:  
Commissioners Present: Ray Ann Kilen, Erv Bren, Cal Kolling, Ron Lisko and Glen Roshau  
Commissioners Absent: n/a  
Also Present: Shawn Kessel, Cathy Murphy, Kandice Dvorak, Jan Zent, Denny Smith, Kim Kainz, Denise Brezden, Dustin Dassinger, Bob Sivak, Bill Fahlsing, Tina Johnson, Ed Krank, Karen Buresh, Tiffany Messer, Leonard Schwindt, Aaron Praus, and Jeremy Moser.
3. ORDER OF BUSINESS:  
Approved as presented.
4. CONSENT AGENDA:  
n/a
5. TIME TABLE ISSUES:
  - a. 9:30 AM – Public Hearing – Classification System  
Ray Ann Kilen opened the hearing at 9:53 AM.

Shawn Kessel stated 1 ½ ago the City underwent a process of looking at how services are delivered. This process led to reorganization in several departments, most noticeably in the police department with putting two captains in place and doing away with the lieutenant positions. Also at that time Kessel stated the designations of laborer through director were put in place and all job descriptions were assigned a level. Kessel stated the classification system in front of Civil Service took this one step further. Kessel stated information was gathered from salary surveys and from four like cities, Williston, Mandan, West Fargo and Jamestown. A market study was done to determine where our current staffing system is. Kessel stated in doing this a new pay scale has been developed. Kessel stated with the new pay scale there is less overlap and there will be 10 annual step increases. Kessel stated the new pay scale changes the number of grades from 15 to 10. Kessel stated with the new system, no one would see a decrease in wages. The rationale is to have market based pay for like job descriptions. Kilen asked if the local market was used in the market study. Kessel indicated as much as possible, but private business weren't willing to give much information. Kessel stated information was provided from both SW Water Authority and also Stark County.

Kilen stated the role of Civil Service is to deal with the structure, however, she stated she's not sure when she had so many calls from concerned employees. Cal Kolling questioned if there was a point system for reclassifications, how will positions be reclassified. Kessel stated some time ago Civil Service was presented with the Labor to Director flow chart. Kessel stated he recognizes the need to develop compensable factors for future reclassifications and movement. Kilen stated the system provides alignment, but she's unsure of how positions were placed other than possibly by education.

Kessel stated if you recall the different levels changed based on years of experience, supervisory duties and also education. Kessel stated this is not as defined as the Fox Lawson system. Kolling questioned if the move then was to compensable factors. Kessel indicated it was. Kessel stated in doing so everyone would know what it takes to move to the next level.

Ron Lisko stated he would like to see what the changes are. Kessel referenced the enclosure showing the old classification system and the proposed classification system. Kessel stated a positions placement on the old versus the new is not necessarily going to be the same. Kessel reminded the Commission the new system places position based on experience, education, supervisory and pay. Kessel stated he believes the new system will be better for the employees. Kilen commented she's concerned that the new classification is still a work in progress with the compensable factors not being clearly defined. Lisko agreed with Kilen. Kilen stated while the factors may be clear to you (Shawn), they are not clear in the employee's mind. Kilen stated there needs to be something similar to the way applicants are scored in place that puts the positions where they need to be.

Erv Bren stated the new system needs to start some place. Bren stated there needs to be additional factors in place. Kilen stated that it makes sense how some of the departments were placed, the PD and Water Utilities, but there are gray areas for some of the positions. Kilen stated the gaps need to be fixed, a tool is need again maybe something similar to applicant scoring. Kessel stated he acknowledges that and some factors need to be more defined. Kessel stated the laborer to director flow chart helps though as it gives a visual. Kessel stated there is never going to be a "perfect" system.

Kilen commented a defined structure would help the City from going back words. Kilen stated when she came on to the Civil Service there was much distrust by the employees and it has gotten better, but is afraid of returning to the mistrust.

Ron Lisko stated he would like to hear from employees in the audience.

Leonard Schwindt questioned who gathered the info. Kessel stated he and Cianni contacted peer Cities and completed salary surveys. Schwindt asked if the comparisons were done job to job or responsibilities to responsibilities. Kessel stated most sent job descriptions, with Mandan being one of the most similar, but duties were compared.

Jan Zent questioned what factors were used in considering the placement of positions. Zent stated she understands things have to start from somewhere, but feels the factors should be in place before the placements are approved. Zent commented a lot of employees don't have a clue how the proposed system was created.

Denise Brezden asked about the position designations and when they were put in place. Kessel stated about 1 ½ ago all positions were assigned a designation of laborer, operator, etc. Brezden questioned if there are minutes as to when the positions were reviewed and given a designation. Kilen stated with the start of the reorganizing Civil Service was involved in the concept, and now we need to make sure job descriptions are in the right spot that may not be obvious.

Kilen gave the Commission a couple of options to move forward, they could do nothing or another option would be to accept the structure as presented and ask that compensable factors be developed and then validate the structure. Cal Kolling stated there should be another hearing with additional information prior to approval. Lisko stated he's not ready to vote on the issue without further information. Bren stated he has gone through a similar process with his agency and had to deal with hard feelings, but that much of that was because employees didn't understand. Bren stated we have to get to a system with more fairness and equity as the current system is broken. Kilen stated the City has been wafting outside of the Fox Lawson system for some time and that she is looking to be able to embrace the new structure, but feels the factors are missing.

Kilen stated she would like to propose another hearing. At the hearing Kilen stated it would be helpful if the organizational chart of both individual departments and overall would be available. Kilen stated the compensable factors also needed to be identified for the next hearing.

Roshau agreed with Kilen. Roshau suggested there be some employee participation in the compensable factors as it may help ensure nothing is missed. Roshau also stated by having the employees involved helps keep the trust.

Kolling stated he doesn't feel it's the job of Civil Service to put together the compensable factors, but suggested the City utilized someone who works with compensation to help put the factors together. Lisko suggested using the SAHRA group for gathering input.

Discussion continued to the effect this will be system that will treat employees better and raise their pay quicker and by not doing anything the City will fall behind.

Kilen stated when the item is brought back to Civil Service there should be wage information, organizational charts and the factors and things will probably fall into place. Kilen stated the information will need to go to both Civil Service and the employees.

Kilen closed the hearing at 11:03 AM with the understanding another hearing will be scheduled to approve the new classification system.

6. GENERAL ISSUES

a. Roster Approval – Water Utility Operator

MOTION BY: Ron Lisko

SECONDED BY: Cal Kolling

To approve the Water Utility Operator roster of Joyce Braun, Nathan Dubois, Doug Harrington, Richard Scheeler, Danny Smith, Kraig Subart and Jason Virt.

DISPOSITION: Motion carried unanimously.

b. Reclassification Request – Administrative Clerk (Baler Bldg.)

Glen Roshau asked if this was a request from a grade 1 to a grade 2. Ray Ann Kilen indicated the request was to move to a grade 3. Kilen also stated the position would move forward now, but possibly back word if moved to a Utility Billing Clerk with the new classification system if approved. Kilen stated Aaron Praus was to review the Utility Billing Clerk and Administrative Assistant job descriptions and decide which of the two positions the duties were most related to.

Kilen gave background of the reclassification to the other commissioners indicating this was presented at a previous meeting, but removed with staff directed to decide if the position should be reclassified to the Utility Billing Clerk or the Administrative Assistant. Aaron Praus when originally discussed the request was to the Utility Billing Clerk. Praus indicated after reviewing the duties against the job descriptions with Cianni, he decided the position was more closely related to the Administrative Assistant.

Shawn Kessel stated he was at the meeting when the reclassification was first presented and supports a status change for the position. Kessel stated the Public Works Departments have been dealing with a lot of transition with the loss of staff and current staff has stepped up. Kessel stated he feels the position is more in alignment with the Utility Billing Clerk and that he would be in favor of a reclassification to the Utility Billing Clerk position. Kessel stated he agrees Tiffany has stepped up and is making things more efficient, however he says he's not sure he supports the position not being entry level.

Roshau suggested if it was possible that the employee be promoted rather than reclassify the position.

Kilen commented the Administrative Assistant and the Utility Billing Clerk are both in the same grade. Kessel agreed, but stated this will change in the future. Kilen confirmed Kessel saw the position more in line with the Utility Billing Clerk. Kessel commented the positions are now in the same grade and there is no problem, but if the position is more administrative assistant, the position potentially changes in 2011 as the positions will no longer be classified in the same grade.

Kessel stated the Administrative Clerk job description is used by two departments, the Police Department and the Baler Building and is likely to vanish in 2011. Kessel stated the Police Department is currently looking to do things differently and will possibly be combing the duties with those of dispatch.

Kilen asked to take a few minutes to compare the information presented with the reclassification.

Erv Bren stated in looking at the Administrative Clerk position and the Utility Billing Clerk position, they look quite similar. Bren then asked if a different job description be used for the position. The duties of the all three, the Administrative Clerk, Administrative Assistant and the Utility Billing Clerk, job descriptions were compared. It was stated the education requirements for the Administrative Assistant and Utility Billing Clerk were the same, but above that of the Administrative Clerk.

Kilen commented, here is what I see, in looking at the duties that have changed there is a lot of alignment with the Utility Billing Clerk, but on the other hand I can see the administrative support that is taking place. Praus stated Tiff does do a lot of reports and prepares for the recycling committee on from the solid waste side. Praus stated with the discussion of mandatory composting Tiff researched and prepared arguments. Praus stated Messer does the payroll entry, cash receipts and ticket entry for the Baler Building. Kilen asked how this was different, how it was more administrative. Tiffany Messer indicated she does a lot of tracking of various items for the department, she handles customers, answers phone calls, directs customers to the correct locations for disposal, enters timesheets.

Cathy Murphy spoke to the Commission indicating specific items the Utility Billing Clerks do. Murphy indicated they maintain over 6,000 billing accounts, assist the engineering department with making copies and completing receipts, they utilize the Web QA system, work with delinquent accounts, open all new accounts, sort incoming and

outgoing mail, make deposits. Murphy stated they are very busy, but feels that everyone works as a team.

Kilen stated she understands what's the same and what the difference are.

Roshau asked if Messer meets the minimum education requirements for the Administrative Assistant. Roshau stated he thinks there is a distinction between the positions. Roshau suggested Messer be moved to an Administrative Assistant leaving the job description for the Administrative Clerk on the books for possible future use. Erv Bren stated he tends to agree with Roshau, the job duties have changed at some point with the position requiring more expertise, and with the departure of upper level management someone has to keep things running, and sees this as an opportunity. Kilen stated the job description for the Baler Building may need to be rewritten. Bren stated possibly, one that works. Bren stated he does feel the position is aligned with the Utility Billing Clerk and Administrative Assistant positions. Kolling also agreed with Roshau on not reclassifying but a change in job description. Kolling stated he would side with the position aligning with the Administrative Assistant position. Kolling also stated the Commission needed to work with the classification system still in place and that the proposed system should be set aside. Ron Lisko stated it appears the duties have changed enough to move the position to the correct classification.

Kessel stated all of City staff is being stretched at this time, with Public Works probably more so than the other departments. Kessel stated once things are stabilized he hopes everything will return to a more normal state.

Praus stated when Chandra Christensen was the Administrative Clerk, she was doing more than the job description essential duties and with Tiff now in the position she's taken on even more. Praus stated when restructuring takes places duties don't go away, someone still has to do them. Kilen commented that she agreed with Praus that this position is going to continue to evolve rather than retract.

Both Roshau and Kolling commented on changing the classification on a temporary basis. Kilen stated the request in front of the Commission is a reclassification request for the position to go from a grade 1 to a grade 3 as an Administrative Assistant.

Ed Krank stated he had worked with Ken Kussy to try and change the Administrative Clerk position, but it never happened. Krank stated he has supported a change to this position, but thinks it's prudent to hold off until a Public Works Director is in place. The Commission questioned it not being done in the past. Praus stated he was made aware of this and brought it forward. Messer commented she was tasked with many of Leroy Hutmacher's duties when he retired. Messer stated a challenge area she's taken on

relates to the community moving towards recycling, she's noticed misunderstanding by the community and has tried to put together information to educate the community.

Kessel commented the Commission was past the time-table agenda item and that the Commission should make a decision or return to the item following the public hearing as several staff members are in the audience. Kilen asked the Commission if they were ready to make a decision or wished to return to the topic. It was decided to return to the topic.

Kessel stated with the compensable factors discussion he suggest holding off on the reclassification until the compensable factors are completed. Kilen stated a decision was needed to table, accept or deny the reclassification and asked for any further discussion.

MOTION BY: Glen Roshau                      SECONDED BY: Cal Kolling

To reclassify the position to Administrative Assistant, with the understanding the position would be filled at Administrative Clerk level if vacated.

DISCUSSION: Bren confirmed the motion was to reclassify the position to a different grade. Kilen stated it would move the employee as the position has changed and questioned where the position should be classified to. Kessel commented if the Administrative Clerk position is reclassified it would reclassify both positions at this level. Roshau stated his motion was to reclassify the Baler Building position. Bren commented it's not Civil Service jurisdiction to decide what positions the city needs. Roshau withdrew his motion, Kolling withdrew the second.

The Commission continued discussion as to what their boundaries were relating to reclassifications. Kilen commented the Commission was getting hung up on semantics, stating this is a pure reclassification the position was Administrative Clerk, but duties for the position at the Baler Building have changed. Lisko asked what recommendation is needed. Kilen stated the item needed to be tabled, approve the request or deny the request.

Kessel stated in listening to the arguments, he doesn't disagree with the performance of Tiffany in the position, but Civil Service needs to consider the position and not the person in the position. Kessel stated until things are more stable within the department it is hard to determine if the all of duties being completed will continue. Kilen stated Aaron Praus has indicated the position is now that of an Administrative Assistant.

MOTION BY: Glen Roshau                      SECONDED BY: Erv Bren

To deny the reclassification of the Administrative Clerk position at the Baler Building to Administrative Assistant.

DISPOSITION: Roll Call Vote...Aye 2, Nay 3, Absent 0

Motion Fails

MOTION BY: Cal Kolling

SECONDED BY: Erv Bren

To approve the reclassification of the Administrative Clerk position at the Baler Building to Administrative Assistant.

DISPOSITION: Roll Call Vote...Aye 2, Nay 3, Absent 0

Motion Fails

MOTION BY: Erv Bren

SECONDED BY: Glen Roshau

To reclassify the Administrative Clerk position at the Baler Building to Utility Billing Clerk.

DISPOSITION: Roll Call Vote...Aye 5, Nay 0, Absent 0

Motion Passes

c. Job Description Update – Senior Police Officer

MOTION BY: Glen Roshau

SECONDED BY:

Erv Bren

To approve the updated Senior Police Officer job description.

DISCUSSION: Kilen asked about the position designation. Kristi Cianni stated this was based on the move to the new classification system.

DISPOSITION: Motion carried unanimously.

d. Other

n/a

7. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION BY: Glen Roshau

SECONDED BY:

Cal Kolling

To adjourn the meeting at 11:51 AM

OFFICIAL MINUTES PREPARED BY:

---

Kristi Cianni

Assistant to City Administrator